



*Palestinian Society and History Review*

No. 1 | Spring | 2006 |

**Published by**  
**Mada al-Carmel**

Arab Center for Applied Social Research  
PO Box 9132  
51 Allenby St.  
Haifa 31090  
Tel: +972-4-8552035  
Fax: +972-4-8525973  
pshr@mada-research.org  
www.mada-research.org

Production & Design: "Majd" Art & Graphic Design

*Editor*

**Ramzi Suleiman**

*Editor-in-Chief*

**Nadim N. Rouhana**

*Editorial Assistants*

**Manal Totry-Jubran, Suha Sibany,  
& Davina Gateley**

*Copy Editor*

**Nabih Bashir**

*Editorial Board*

**Nahla Abdo**

Carleton University

**Ismael Abu-Saad**

Ben-Gurion University of the Negev

**Beshara Doumani**

University of California, Berkeley

**Kais Firro**

University of Haifa

**Lisa Hajjar**

University of California, Santa Barbara

**Hassan Jabareen**

Adalah - The Legal Center for Arab  
Minority Rights in Israel

**Michael Karayanni**

Hebrew University of Jerusalem

**Nur Masalha**

University of Surrey

**Ahmad Sa'di**

Ben-Gurion University of the Negev

**Nadera Shalhoub-Kevorkian**

Hebrew University of Jerusalem

**Salim Tamari**

Birzeit University

## *International Advisory Board*

**Lila Abu-Lughod**  
Columbia University

**Butrus Abu-Manneh**  
University of Haifa

**Mohammed Abu-Nimer**  
American University

**Majid Al-Haj**  
University of Haifa

**Duane Champagne**  
University of California, Los Angeles

**Nancy Fraser**  
New School University, New York

**Avner Giladi**  
University of Haifa

**David Theo Goldberg**  
University of California, Irvine

**Elaine Hagopian**  
Simmons College

**Wael Hallaq**  
McGill University

**Rashid Khalidi**  
Columbia University

**Baruch Kimmerling**  
Hebrew University of Jerusalem

**Will Kymlicka**  
Queen's University

**Ian Lustick**  
University of Pennsylvania

**Timothy Mitchell**  
New York University

**Ilan Pappé**  
University of Haifa

**Rosemary Sayigh**  
Independent Researcher and Writer

**Anton Shammass**  
University of Michigan

**Yehouda Shenhav**  
Tel Aviv University

**Mark Tessler**  
University of Michigan

**Stefano Varese**  
University of California, Davis

**Iris Marion Young**  
University of Chicago

**Nira Yuval-Davis**  
University of Greenwich

**Elia Zureik**  
Queen's University

### ***About the Journal***

*Palestinian Society and History Review* is a refereed academic journal established in 2004 by Mada al-Carmel. It is designed to respond to the pressing need for an independent forum for social and historical research on issues related to the Palestinians in Israel and to Palestinian issues in general.

Established by a group of Palestinian scholars, this journal aims at promoting a new discourse on social, historical, and political issues related to Palestinian and Israeli societies and to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict.

The journal welcomes original contributions from scholars in the social sciences and other disciplines including: sociology, social anthropology, political science, history, social psychology, communications, education, social welfare, law, and economics. The journal encourages the submission of scholarly articles on minority and collective rights, citizenship, democracy, and bi-national and multicultural arrangements in multiethnic states. In addition to scholarly articles and short essays, the journal will publish invited book reviews.

*Palestinian Society and History Review* will be published bi-annually in Arabic. Selected articles from each issue will appear in English on our website ([www.mada-research.org](http://www.mada-research.org)).

### ***Contributors to this Issue***

***Elia Zureik*** is Professor of Sociology at Queen's University. He is the author of *The Palestinians in Israel: A Study in Internal Colonialism* (1979) and *Palestinian Refugees and the Peace Process* (1996). In addition, he has co-edited two books and written numerous articles on Palestine.

***Leila Farsakh*** is Assistant Professor in Political Science at the University of Massachusetts, Boston. She has published various articles and studies on issues related to the Palestinian economy and the Oslo peace process, international migration, and regional integration.

***Yehouda Shenhav*** is Associate Professor of Sociology at Tel Aviv University and is the editor of *Theory & Criticism*. He has written numerous articles and several books, including *Manufacturing Rationality* (2002) and *The Arab-Jews: A Postcolonial Reading of Nationalism, Religion and Ethnicity* (2005).

***Salim Tamari*** is a Professor of Sociology at Birzeit University and Director of the Institute of Jerusalem Studies. He was a visiting Professor at the University of California, Berkeley (2005) and his recent publications include: *The Mountain against the Sea: Studies in Palestinian Urban Culture and Social History* (2006); and *Pilgrims, Lepers, and Stuffed Cabbage: Essays on Jerusalem's Cultural History* (2005).

***Yoav Peled*** is Associate Professor of Political Science at Tel Aviv University. His work has dealt with citizenship and ethnic politics in Israel and with the Israeli-Palestinian peace process. He recently

co-authored *Being Israeli: The Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship* (2002).

***Nadim N. Rouhana*** is General Director of Mada al-Carmel: Arab Center for Applied Social Research and the Henry Hart Rice Professor of Conflict Studies at George Mason University. He is the author of *Palestinian Citizens in an Ethnic Jewish State* (1997) and has written numerous journal articles.

***Nadera Shalhoub-Kevorkian*** is a Senior Lecturer at the Institute of Criminology / Faculty of Law and School of Social Work and Public Welfare at the Hebrew University, Jerusalem. She is a Palestinian feminist-activist, researcher, and human rights advocate.

***Sherene Seikaly*** is a PhD candidate in the Department of History and Middle Eastern Studies at New York University. She is presently working on her dissertation entitled, "Orange groves and department stores: capitalism and consumption in Palestine, 1920-1948."

## | *Abstracts* |

*Elia Zureik*

## **Israeli Discourse on Arab-Jewish Demography**

### ***Abstract***

Without exception, Israeli commentators of various political and disciplinary shades have recently turned their attention to examining Arab-Jewish population balance in the current political dispute between the two peoples. While demography is not new to Zionist and Israeli discourse, its relevance now and the need, in the face of declining Jewish immigration and continuing Arab population growth, to settle once and for all the geography and political contours of the “Jewish” state is greater than ever. The paper situates the debate within discussions about the role of demography in ethnically bound societies, the evolution of population balance between Arabs and Jews since 1948, including population projections should Israel retain its occupation of the West Bank and Gaza, the relationship between modernization and demographic structure, the containment policies of successive Israeli governments toward the Arab population, and the ideological bases of Israeli-Jewish discourse regarding the Arab population as revealed in public opinion data on issues related to population transfer, expulsion, and political disenfranchisement. The paper concludes by pointing out that the population debate is driven by three factors: exaggerating the size of the Arab population in Israel by counting the Arabs of East Jerusalem and the Golan Heights as part of Israel, the inapplicability of the modernization thesis to demography as long as socio-economic policies towards the Arab sector remain discriminatory in their essence, and the tendency to solve the demographic issue by espousing population transfer and land exchange in the name of national security.

---

*Keywords:* Demography, modernization, containment, ideology, security

*Leila Farsakh*

## **From South Africa to Palestine: The Road to Bantustanisation in the West Bank and Gaza Strip**

### *Abstract*

The Palestinian state remains an internationally endorsed project, yet an increasingly difficult one to implement. By analyzing the territorial, legal, and demographic developments that have taken place in the West Bank and the Gaza Strip over the past ten years, this paper assesses the extent to which the prospective Palestinian state has become unattainable. A comparison between the South African apartheid experience and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict is made to shed light on the ways in which the Palestinian territories are becoming analogous to Bantustans. While historical comparisons are never exact or prescriptive, they raise interesting parallels whose implications need to be considered, if not altered, in any attempt to materialize the project of a viable Palestinian independence.

---

*Keywords:* Apartheid, Bantustans, South Africa, West Bank, Gaza Strip, structural developments, Palestinian state

*Yehouda Shenhav*

## **Arab-Jews, Population Exchange, and the Palestinian Right of Return**

### *Abstract*

Israel has used the Arab-Jews, and the population exchange theory, to abdicate its responsibility for the expulsion of the Palestinians from Palestine in 1948 and 1967, to alleviate demands to compensate the Palestinian refugees for their property confiscated by the Israeli government, and to serve as a bargaining chip against the right of return. For all practical purposes, the population exchange initiative was used in the political discourse to legitimize Israel's wrongdoing with regards to the transfer of the Palestinian refugees in 1948. However, Israel has used the theory vaguely and ambiguously throughout the 54 years of its existence. It has used quasi-governmental organizations such as the Jewish Agency and the World Organization of Jews from Arab Countries to blur its practices and at the same time act upon them. This article lays out the genealogy of the theory, describes the strategies of what I term 'constructed ambiguity' and shows the fallacies associated with it. The implications for any possible resolution are discussed.

---

*Keywords:* Arab-Jews, Palestinian Refugees, Right of Return, population exchange, constructed ambiguity

*Salim Tamari*

## **Ishaq al-Shami and the Predicament of the Arab-Jew in Palestine**

### ***Abstract***

Ishaq al-Shami is a forgotten figure in modern Palestinian history. As an Arab-Jewish writer, he was ignored by Arab critics for writing (mainly) in Hebrew. He was also ignored as a Jewish writer for his excessive Arabness, and because his themes were deemed too ethnographic (i.e., not universal) by the Hebrew revivalists like Brenner. Al-Shami's intellectual production defies categorization since he neither adhered to the Zionist project, nor did he become a member of the circle of modernist Arab intelligentsia that included Jouzi, Sakakini, and al-Nashashibi. His uniqueness lies in the fact that although he wrote mainly in Hebrew, his motifs, environment, and characters were almost entirely Arab and Muslim. This essay attempts to review his literary production in the context of the declining identity of the Arab-Jew. Al-Shami's roots in the Jewish community of Hebron, his rebellion against the prevailing religious orthodoxy, his adoption of Hebrew as a marker of modernity, and his marginalization by both his native Arab society and the Jewish Yishuv are highlighted.

---

*Keywords:* Ishaq al-Shami, Arab-Jews, national Arab identity, Mandatory Palestine, Zionism, Israel, literature in Hebrew

*Yoav Peled*

## **No 'Arab-Jews' There – Shas and the Palestinians**

### *Abstract*

The hardening of Shas' attitudes towards the Palestinians, both citizens and non-citizens, over the past five years should not be surprising. Shas' "dovishness" had always been largely an optical illusion, because its constituency had always been more hawkish than any other group of voters in the Israeli electorate. The party elite, on the other hand, was much more moderate in its views, and in 1979 Rav Ovadiah Yosef, the party's spiritual leader, had issued a famous edict about the permissibility of returning territories in order to prevent the spilling of Jewish blood. Under the leadership of Arie'el Deri, the party knew how to maneuver between these two positions, allowing the Oslo agreements to pass in the Knesset without actually voting for them. Without Deri, however, Shas withdrew from Ehud Barak's government on the eve of the Camp David summit of July 2000, and since the outbreak of the al-Aqsa intifada, its positions have been indistinguishable from those of the right-wing parties. This change in Shas's political posture corrected the anomaly of a political party behaving more or less in defiance of the wishes of its voters. What needs to be explained, therefore, is why the Shas voters, almost exclusively *Mizrachim* of the lower socio-economic strata, most of them moderately orthodox in their religious observance ("traditionalists"), hold these trenchant views on the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. This essay proposes a three-layer explanation for this phenomenon: labor-market competition, identity politics, and fear of liberalization/globalization.

---

*Keywords:* Israel, Palestinians, Shas, *Mizrachim*, *Charedim*, Arab-Jews, globalization, labor market

*Nadim N. Rouhana*

## **Truth and Reconciliation: The Right of Return in the Context of Past Injustice**

### *Abstract*

This paper examines the question of the Palestinian Right of Return in a theoretical context that considers justice, historic truth and responsibility, and social and political restructuring as requirements for historic reconciliation in the conflict between Israelis and Palestinians. The paper distinguishes between a settlement based on power relations and reconciliation that is based on the recognition of mutual legitimacy. The main arguments in this paper are: First, that the resistance of this conflict to resolution is inherent in its nature as a conflict between an undefeated (and perhaps undefeatable) homeland nation and an ongoing colonization project in which the colony itself was transformed into the colonizer's homeland. Second, that reconciliation between Zionism and the Palestinian National Movement is unattainable and reconciliation between Israelis and Palestinians cannot at this stage in history be a realistic goal for the foreseeable future. The paper argues that the differences around the Right of Return reflect irreconcilable past and divergent visions of the future. Third, that a peaceful settlement, but not reconciliation, is imaginable but that it requires historic and controversial compromises within each community.

---

*Keywords:* Reconciliation, justice, historical responsibility, Right of Return, homeland nation, dynamics of fear and extremism

## ***Call for Papers***

Mada al-Carmel is pleased to announce a call for papers for the coming issues of its newly established journal, *Palestinian Society and History Review*.

The journal is interdisciplinary in nature. It welcomes original contributions from the social sciences and other disciplines including: sociology, social anthropology, political science, history, social psychology, communications, education, social welfare, law, and economics.

Studies that adopt an interdisciplinary approach while focusing on Palestinian issues are especially welcome. The journal also welcomes studies that take a critical approach, especially with regard to Zionist narrative and Zionist discourse that dominate Israeli historiography and social science research.

*Palestinian Society and History Review* is a refereed journal. It is published bi-annually in Arabic. Papers may be submitted for publication in Arabic, Hebrew, or English. Selected articles from each issue will appear in English on our website ([www.mada-research.org](http://www.mada-research.org)).

*Articles can be in one of two formats:*

1. Referenced research articles (about 8,000 words), written in accordance with the instructions for authors on the next page. All research articles will be reviewed by an editor and by two anonymous reviewers. The journal does not accept published articles or articles that are under consideration for publication elsewhere.

2. Short essays (1,000-1,500 words) can be written in a free style. Their evaluation will be based primarily on insightfulness, originality of ideas, and novelty of perspective. All essays will be reviewed by the journal editor.

In addition to scholarly articles and short essays, the journal publishes

invited book reviews.

Manuscripts, editorial correspondence, and books for review should be sent to:

Ramzi Suleiman  
Editor, *Palestinian Society and History Review*  
Mada al-Carmel-Arab Center for Applied Social Research  
51 Allenby St.  
PO Box 9132  
Haifa 31090  
Israel  
Email: Suleiman@mada-research.org

### ***Instructions for Authors***

#### *Referenced scientific articles:*

1. Scientific articles should not exceed 8,000 words, including the footnotes and tables. Submissions in English should be in Times New Roman font (12 pt.), double-spaced and with generous margins.
2. All submissions should include a title page showing the article's title and the author's name(s) and contact information.
3. The following page should include an abstract of about 250 words and no more than seven keywords.
4. Endnotes should be numbered consecutively and appear as an independent unit at the end of the text.
5. Each table should be printed on a separate page at the end of the article. A short descriptive title should appear above each table.
6. The same applies to figures. The figures should appear at the end of the article after the tables, preceded with the figure captions.

7. Each article should be accompanied by a brief biographical statement about the author(s).

*Short Essays:*

Short essays should be about 1,500 words long and written in a free style. The essays do not have to follow the citation instructions detailed below.

*Book Reviews:*

*Palestinian Society and History Review* publishes invited book reviews. Reviews should not exceed 1,500 words and should include a summary of the book. Each review should start with a complete citation (author's name, book's title, place of publication, publisher's name and publication date), and the number of pages in the book, all written in the language in which the book was published.

*Citation style:*

Except for legal articles, which should follow the citation rules acceptable in their field, all other articles should follow these standards:

1. References having one or two authors should be cited in the text by writing the last name(s) of the author(s) and date of publication in parentheses, e.g., (Rosenstone 1993) for a single author source or (Rosenstone and Hansen 1993) for a dual-authored source.
2. References with more than two authors should be cited on first appearance in the text by writing out all authors' names, and later on by using a short form, e.g., (Rosenstone *et al.* 1993).
3. When multiple references are cited, they should appear in chronological order by publication date from less to more recent separated by a semicolon e.g., (Rosenstone 1993; Said 1997).
4. When citing two references by the same author(s) that were published in the same year, the citation should appear as follows: (Rosenstone 1993a, 1993b).

5. When quoting from a certain reference, end the quotation by citing the reference including the exact page number from which the citation was taken, e.g., (Rosenstone 1993, 55).

*Reference List:*

Said, E. (1997). The real meaning of the Hebron agreement, *Journal of Palestine Studies*, 26(3), 31-36.

Kymlicka, W. (1995). *Multicultural Citizenship*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

The reference should be listed in the language in which it was published, unless it is not possible to do so.

*Palestinian Society and History Review* (ISSN 1565-8155) is published bi-annually by Mada al-Carmel, PO Box 9132, 51 Allenby Street, Haifa 31090, Israel. Subscription rate per year is \$20, with additional postage charges of \$4 inside Israel and \$8 airmail delivery abroad.

POSTMASTER: Send all address changes to: *Palestinian Society and History Review*, Mada al-Carmel, PO Box 9132, 51 Allenby Street, Haifa 31090, Israel.

Opinions expressed in *Palestinian Society and History Review* are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the opinions of Mada al-Carmel. Quotations from articles and other passages from the *Review* may not be reproduced for sales or advertising purposes without the prior written permission of both author and publisher.



*Palestinian Society and History Review*

No. 1 | Spring | 2006 |

*Elia Zureik*

Israeli Discourse on Arab-Jewish Demography

*Leila Farsakh*

From South Africa to Palestine: The Road to Bantustanisation in  
the West Bank and Gaza Strip

*Yehouda Shenhav*

Arab-Jews, Population Exchange, and the Palestinian Right of Return

*Salim Tamari*

Ishaq al-Shami and the Predicament of the Arab-Jew in Palestine

*Yoav Peled*

No 'Arab-Jews' There – Shas and the Palestinians

*Nadim N. Rouhana*

Truth and Reconciliation: The Right of Return in the Context of Past Injustice

***Book Reviews***

*Nadera Shalhoub-Kevorkian*

On Rhoda Ann Kanaanah's *Birthing the Nation*

*Sherene Seikaly*

On Ellen Fleischmann's *The Nation and its New Women*